Development and Application of a Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis Software Tool for Renewable Energy Sources

(MCDA-RES)

Contract NNE5-2001-273
Deliverable D12: Development of the CD and related manual

MCDA-RES – WP3: The development of the multimedia based software package

Development and Application of a Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis Tool For Renewable Energy Resources

Public

MCDA-RES
NNE5-2001-273

Project Coordinator: University of the Aegean (GR)

Partners: Economic and Social Institute, Free University Amsterdam (NL)
          Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona (SP)
          Exergia SA (GR)
          Regional Energy Agency of Crete (GR)

Date: July 2004

PROJECT FUNDED BY THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION UNDER THE EESD 5th FRAMEWORK PROGRAMME
THE MCDA TOOLKIT MANUAL (version 1.0)

Contents
0. Introduction
1. Main Screens
2. The MCDA Tool-kit
3. MCDA 8 STEPS process
4. Case-studies
   4.1 Greece
   4.2 Netherlands
   4.3 Spain
5. Conclusions
0. Introduction
The basic steps for the MCDA toolkit manual are presented in the following pages. It is advisable that the user follows the manual in relation with the internet-based toolkit as it can be found in the relevant site:

http://www.exergia.net/mcda

Note: Please forward all comments, errata, etc. to the following address:
Stavros Kourvas [S.Kourvas@exergia.gr]
1. Main Screens

Screen 1.1: Initial screen – Home

It provides an introduction to the MCDA-RES project; participants, duration, description of work, aim - objectives, work packages, etc.

An overview of the Mytilene and Amsterdam workshops is also presented (topics, description, participants, related presentations, virtual exercises, etc).
Screen 1.2: Project reports

The project Deliverables accepted so far by the Commission Services can be found in the MCDA-RES web-site.
Screen 1.3: Contact details page

This page provides to the user with a communication gate with the consortium.
2. The MCDA Tool-kit

Screen 2.1: The MCDA Tool-kit, initial page

It introduces the concept of multi-criteria analysis to the user and explains its appropriateness in renewable energy planning and decision-making.
In order to provide a user-friendly approach for the multi-criteria analysis of RES projects, the whole process is divided into 8 distinct steps, namely:

STEP 1: Problem Identification and Initial Data Collection

STEP 2: Identification of Stakeholders

STEP 3: Creation of Alternatives

STEP 4: Establishment of Criteria

STEP 5: Criteria Evaluation & Preference Elicitation

STEP 6: Selection of the MCDA technique

STEP 7: Model Application

STEP 8: Stakeholder analysis of the results - feedback

Proposal for Implementation

Iterative Procedure

Level of acceptance – High and low?

HIGH

LOW
STEP 4: Establishment of Criteria

STEP 5: Criteria Evaluation and Preference Elicitation

STEP 6: Selection of the MCDA Technique

STEP 7: Model Application

STEP 8: Stakeholders Analysis of Results and Feedback

The user can click on any STEP and gain access to complementary information.
Screen 2.3: The MCDA process – Examples of implementation of different steps

The MCDA process can be accessed by either following the 8-STEPS approach, or through the case-studies in Greece, Netherlands and Spain. This Screen provides the main navigator gate.
Screen 2.4: Case-studies, learning experiences

The case-studies are considered as learning experiences. The user could gain insights of the way to implement the MCDA-RES Tool-kit.

The case-studies comprise:

- Four (4) case-studies in Greece
  - No.1: Wind and hydro energy (islandic – non interconnected system)
  - No. 2: Wind energy (main land – interconnected system)
  - No.3: Wind energy (islandic – non interconnected system)
  - No.4: Geothermal energy (autonomous thermal applications)

- Two (2) case-studies in the Netherlands
  - No.1: Wind energy
  - No. 2: Wind energy

- Two (2) case-studies in Spain
  - No.1: Wind energy
  - No. 2: Solar energy
Screen 2.5: RES applications and useful links

The user can access primary information regarding the different types of renewable energy and their pertinent applications. Photos and related presentations are also included. Links to the various Databases are also provided, according to the type of RES application selected.
3. MCDA 8 STEPS process

Screen 3.1: MCDA 8 Steps process

This is an initial introduction to the 8-STEP multi-criteria approach for integrated evaluation of RES projects. It presents the theoretical part of the Tool-kit and it also includes specific guidelines for decision-making.
Screen 3.2: STEP 4 – Establishment of criteria

Five (5) main categories of evaluation criteria have been identified: energy, economic, environmental social and technological. A preliminary set (a total of 20 criteria), was drafted on this basis. Certain criteria are measured on a quantitative impact scale while for others a qualitative impact scale has been used. This Screen presents the proposed criteria related to the energy-resource base.
**Screen 3.3: STEP 6 – Selection of the MCDA technique**

A number of multi-criteria decision analysis techniques can be found. The MCDA-RES Tool-kit incorporates 4 methods-techniques, namely:

- REGIME - FLAG models
- ELECTRE III
- PROMETHEE II
- NAIADE

The user could follow specific guidelines to choose the appropriate MCDA technique for her particular case.
**Screen 3.4: STEP 7 - Model application**

In order to actually apply the MCDA-RES Tool-kit, the user should download a particular method – software. Manual for each software is also included.
4. Case-studies

4.1 Greece

Screen 4.1.1: The case-studies in Greece – Introductory page

This Screen provides an overview of the four (4) case-studies in Greece.
Screen 4.1.2: Greek case-study No.1 – STEP 1

This Screen corresponds to STEP 1 of the 1st Greek case-study.

Type of RES: Wind and Hydro Energy

Selected MCDA technique: PROMETHEE II
Screen 4.1.3: Greek case-study No.1 – STEP 3

Presentation of Alternative Scenario No.2: The hybrid (wind-hydro) plant in Ikaria Island.
Screen 4.1.4: Greek case-study No.1 – STEP 4

Presentation of the Technological Criteria selected for the 1st Greek case-study.
Material for each STEP and case-study can also be accessible in PDF format to enable easy overview and printed layout. This Screen presents the type of stakeholders that have been identified for the Greek case-studies and particularly for case-study No 2 (wind energy).
Screen 4.1.6: Greek case-study No.2 – STEP 7

The results of the model application are presented in a Table and Graphic format.
3. STEP 3: CREATION OF ALTERNATIVES

Case study No 3: Lefkos Island – Andissa

1st scenario: “Do nothing”
No additional WTs will be installed in the area. Current wind capacity installed in the area is 7.2 MW (12 W/T * 0.6 MW each).

2nd scenario: “Extension of the existing wind park”
In the second scenario the plans of the investors (Elliniki Technologiki Energiaki S.A.), are exactly followed. Another 3 WTs of 6.6 MW each are to be installed at the area of the existing wind park.

Screen 4.1.7: Greek case-study No.3 – STEP 3 (PDF version)

The Alternative Scenarios formulated for the 3rd case-study in Greece.
Type of RES: Wind Energy
No of alternatives: 2
Selected MCDA technique: PROMETHE II
**Screen 4.1.8: Greek case-study No.3 – STEP 5**

This Screen presents the results of the weight elicitation module.

**Decision-Maker:** Non-governmental Organization – GREENPEACE

No of criteria: 18
Screen 4.1.9: Greek case-study No.3 – STEP 8 (PDF version)

Every PDF file starts with a Table of Contents indicating the particular case-study and STEP.
Screen 4.1.10: Greek case-study No.4 – STEP 5

The evaluation criteria and the elicitation of preference for the 4th case-study in Greece

Type of RES: Geothermal Energy

Decision-Maker: Investor

No of Criteria: 7
The selection of the appropriate MCDA technique

For the 4th Greek case-study, both the ELECTRE III and the PROMETHEE II MCDA techniques have been selected and applied.
Screen 4.1.12: Greek case-study No.4 – STEP 7

Results of the PROMETHEE II method and ranking of alternative scenarios for the Decision-Maker: Investor (graphical presentation)
4.2 Netherlands

Screen 4.2.1: Dutch case-study No.1 – STEP 1

Problem Identification and Initial Data Collection; Policy Data

Type of RES: Wind Energy

MCDA technique: REGIME Analysis
Screen 4.2.2: Dutch case-study No.1 – STEP 8 (PDF version)

Stakeholders’ analysis of results and feedback

Preferred wind mills locations according to REGIME Analysis
Screen 4.2.3: Dutch case-study No.2 – STEP 6

Selected MCDA technique: FLAG model
Screen 4.3.1: Spanish case-study No.1 – STEP 1
Problem Identification and Initial Data Collection; Evaluation of potential of renewable energy source
Screen 4.3.2: Spanish case-study No.1 – STEP 2

Identification of Stakeholders

Participatory tool applied for approaching the social actors involved

Institutional Analysis
Screen 4.3.3: Spanish case-study No.1 – STEP 3

Visual presentation of the Alternative Scenarios formulated for the 1st case-study in Spain
Screen 4.3.4: Spanish case-study No.1 – STEP 5 (PDF version)

Criteria for evaluating local visual impact – relevant parameters
Screen 4.3.5: Spanish case-study No.1 – STEP 7
Model Application: NAIADE method
**Screen 4.3.6: Spanish case-study No.2 – STEP 1**

Ideal problem structuring in Social Multi-Criteria Evaluation

**Type of RES:** Solar Energy

**Application:** PV systems

**Selected MCDA Technique:** NAIADE
Screen 4.3.7: Spanish case-study No.2 – STEP 7

Model Application: NAIADE method; Presentation of the results
5. Conclusions

The main objective of the FP5 – EESD MCDA-RES project is the development of a Software Decision Tool that will enable the Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis (MCDA) of energy projects utilizing Renewable Energy Sources (RES) and the comparative assessment of its application in three case-studies in different member states of the EU. This manual provides an overview of the MCDA-RES software Tool-kit. The Tool-kit is currently available on-line at the web-site: 

www.exergia.net/mcda

A CD off-line version of the Tool-kit is also provided.

The Tool-kit initially provides information regarding the methodological approach of multi-criteria analysis and its suitability in renewable energy planning and evaluation of RES projects. Subsequently, it gives an overview of the different types of RES applications, including examples, photos, virtual presentations and exercises. The results of two (2) relevant Workshops organized in Greece (Lesvos-Mytilene) and Netherlands (Amsterdam) are also included.

The decision-making process is structured around 8 distinct steps, as presented earlier. These steps provide a general outline for understanding and applying the Tool-kit. They can be followed either by a theoretical means or through the practical application of the Tool-kit in 8 different case-studies in Greece, Netherlands and Spain. A main navigator Screen guides the user in her choice of the theoretical (experienced users) or the practical (non-experts) way of the CD implementation.

The case-studies include wind, hydro, solar and geothermal ventures, interconnected or non-interconnected systems, electrical and thermal uses, islandic or main land areas, and different multi-criteria analytical techniques. Each case-study is structured around the eight (8) proposed steps and the user can easily navigate between different steps, case-studies and types of RES. The case-studies’ material is also available in PDF form in order to enable the user for easy overview and printed layout.
The MCDA-RES Tool-kit will be concluded after the Training Course, where it will be thoroughly presented to pertinent stakeholders from Greece, Netherlands and Spain. It is anticipated that valuable feedback will be gained and the Tool-kit will be accordingly complemented and improved.